

## FM REVIEW 2009-2012 18

COMMENTS TO EDITOR: This one is very borderline for me. I get that it is meant to be funny - I don't find it as funny as I suspect the author intends. I get that it is, in the words of reviewer 2, a "zen koan." But I'm not sure the content actually justifies the level of contemplation and meditation a koan is supposed to trigger. Also, I may be prudish, but the title is just not cute enough to keep - although I'm sure it would attract readers - but also perhaps repel readers.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR: Although this is a charming little tale, I am concerned that it doesn't quite work. One reviewer refers to it as a Zen koan, but I don't think it has the clarity of vision to really merit that level of reflection and contemplation. For this journal, you really need to help the reader out more. What is the point? Is this a story about worlds colliding? Is it a tale about your own education as a young physician? Is it about what the west can learn from the east? The ending is simply too abrupt. Editors and reviewers alike were sure there was something missing. To be accepted in this journal, it needs to be more than a somewhat amusing story. Our readers probably don't have the time to ponder it as much as you'd like, so try to be clearer about what you want to convey. Also, we feel the title, while eye-catching, is not appropriate for a professional journal. Please come up with a new title.

COMMENTS TO EDITOR II: John, I think this turned out to be a fine essay. It is for all intents and purposes almost a new essay, so if you'd like me to send it out for review again, of course I'll be glad to. But I think all our concerns are met - the title is now more appropriate; the "points" of the essay are now elaborated and made explicit; and the author's personal journey toward vegetarianism is shared in a whimsical, humble style. I think in its present form the article will raise interesting questions for our readers about the relationship between alternative and western medicine, about how learners evolve into doctors, and about the intersection of art and science.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR II: Thank you for such a thoughtful response to reviewers' and editor concerns. This has become a charming longer tale, and one that in its present form will be more accessible to our readers. You help lead us toward many intriguing questions about alternative and western understandings of health and illness, as well as about the process of becoming a physicians, with its significant enlargements and inevitable losses. The article is enhanced by skillful writing and a whimsical, humble tone. I especially appreciated the empathy for the students' journey expressed in the concluding line.